
This is an electronic reprint of the original article.
This reprint may differ from the original in pagination and typographic detail.

Lehtinen, Jere; Aaltonen, Kirsi

Organizing external stakeholder engagement in inter-organizational projects

Published in:
International Journal of Project Management

DOI:
[10.1016/j.ijproman.2019.12.001](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijproman.2019.12.001)

Published: 01/02/2020

Document Version
Peer-reviewed accepted author manuscript, also known as Final accepted manuscript or Post-print

Published under the following license:
CC BY-NC-ND

Please cite the original version:
Lehtinen, J., & Aaltonen, K. (2020). Organizing external stakeholder engagement in inter-organizational projects: Opening the black box. *International Journal of Project Management*, 38(2), 85-98.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijproman.2019.12.001>

This material is protected by copyright and other intellectual property rights, and duplication or sale of all or part of any of the repository collections is not permitted, except that material may be duplicated by you for your research use or educational purposes in electronic or print form. You must obtain permission for any other use. Electronic or print copies may not be offered, whether for sale or otherwise to anyone who is not an authorised user.

Appendix A1: Data structure

Organizing solutions	Code categories	Empirical codes	Sample quotes of empirical evidence
Governance-based solutions	Engagement activities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Information distribution via websites, value-for-money reporting, leaflets and bulletin 	<p>“Information was disseminated and shared regularly and openly to local residents, stakeholders and decision-makers throughout the project by means of a range of different channels, public events, negotiations, meetings, presentations, social media and conventional media. All feedback from local residents and citizens was responded to and action was taken as required.” (Value-for-money report, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“I think that general information provision has been exceptional in this project. We send out press releases and other bulletins and weekly handouts, and one can follow the project’s progress from the webpages and so on.” (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“We have invested in informing stakeholders more than in our other projects.” (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“About this weekly bulletin... we have been delivering a similar report to operator [Track Operator] for the past years. We have also delivered a lot of material to [National Transport Safety Agency].” (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>“Of course, we have very typical webpages for the project [to share information]. We also use it [the webpages] in stakeholder collaboration.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Information events, such as ‘Communication campaign’ and big media events 	<p>“A few big media events are arranged in the start-up of the site work, which aim to communicate and disseminate information about the project and the traffic arrangements during construction. In the first events of this kind, a representative group of experts were present to answer any questions and to give different perspectives on the project. Information events are arranged once a month throughout the project. The same stakeholders are always invited, e.g. property owners, house managers, traders, officials, media and other key stakeholders.” (Project plan, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“We have had several meetings and information events with municipalities and with [Economic, Development, Transport and Environment Agency].” (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>“During the implementation, we have considered the environment better than usually by taking into account the residents in the area who are influenced by the project. We organize these information events regularly and we have put a lot of effort in this as we have seen it necessary.” (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“In the second phase, information events are arranged for the residents a few weeks before they can feel the effects of the excavation in their building. The residents are told how long the excavations will last and other details. By previous experience, these events often change the uncertain perception of the residents into an interest in the excavations.” (Project plan, project Road Tunnel)</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Dialogue events to interact with external stakeholders, such as workshops 	<p>“...there are workshops where we seek to [engage] broadly with [external] stakeholders. About 15 to 20 persons from the client side participate in these workshops.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>“Workshop work was also applied to [external] stakeholder cooperation, such as in connection with line relocations, tunnel safety, and maintenance and traffic control.” (Value-for-money report, project Road Tunnel)</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Invited visits to construction site and Big Room 	<p>“We have plenty of these tours, where visitors come, and we introduce the project and alliance delivery method in detail, and they ask a lot of questions. We also hold these open resident events at our offices. We have told [external stakeholders] that they are more than welcome to visit the</p>

			<p>construction site, and every once in a while, someone actually physically visits our construction site to ask something. People who live next to the construction site and within its sphere of influence also visit us here at our office, and we engage in conversation.” (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“We have this railroad site meeting practice, where we invite other contractors and maintenance actors [external stakeholders] who work on different projects but on the same track area, to discuss about how to schedule work and logistics together to fit every actors’ needs. We also inform those [external stakeholders] about our works.” (Engineer, project Railroad)</p> <p>“This is an interesting project because we have a lot of visitors from many different actors in a weekly basis.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p>
	Organizational structures	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Communication team, its purpose, roles and responsibilities for external stakeholder engagement 	<p>“We communicated with external stakeholders through these small groups.” (Consultant, project Railroad)</p> <p>“We divide tasks [in teams], and responsibility for contacting external stakeholders is assigned to our dedicated spokesperson.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>“It [responsibility to communicate with external stakeholders] belongs to this group [communication team]. And in this group [communication team] we have specific personnel designated for communication.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>“We have this separate communication team, where I am the chair, but we also have publicists from others [internal stakeholders]. We have prepared a communications plan, which we implement and follow-up constantly, and we try to identify ways how the communications can help the construction site from [communications] overload.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>“Conversations with [external stakeholders] have been very efficiently confined to a few persons and [the communication team].” (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“I have a bit of a special purpose in this project. I do not design, I do not build, but I communicate and I am the link outwards [to external stakeholders] and also inwards to core to project and assistant project managers.” (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“The task of the Communications Team is to direct, plan and coordinate the communications of the Alliance and its stakeholders so that the project communications objectives defined in the development phase are met as well as possible. The CT updates the communications plan devised in the DP phase as well as adding more detailed instructions (disturbances and other communications).” (Project plan, project Road Tunnel)</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Forming project organization with partners who understand Value-for-money principles and objectives 	<p>“The requirements and discussions and workshops in different phases of tendering ensured that bidders had understanding, correct attitude and capability to work in alliance and the ability to produce value for money.” (Value-for-money report, project Railroad)</p> <p>“With regard to alliance capability and management, the following were evaluated [in tendering and selecting partners]: Commitment and the ability to operate according to the principles and targets of the alliance.” (Value-for-money report, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“None of us really had any experience in working in alliance project. So we hired an external coach to prepare us for working in alliance and understand the principles and values.” (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“Procedures that increased efficiency in the project focused mainly on the benefits of stakeholder collaboration enabled by alliance delivery model.” (Value-for-money report, project Railroad)</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project organization kept as unchanged as possible (key personnel bound to project) 	<p>“The composition of the Alliance in the development phase will be kept unchanged as far as possible in the implementation phase, to ensure that the Alliance ethos, cooperation and approved practices</p>

			<p>created in the development phase are transferred to the implementation phase.” (Project plan, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“Yes, in principle yes. In long projects, there are unavoidable personnel changes, but in this case, we try to bind [key] personnel. It is not for the benefit of the parent company either, if we change the entire personnel and the new personnel would be at a loss regarding the alliance model.” (Manager, Project Railroad)</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Neutral experts (observers) participate in meetings to report outwards and promote transparency to external stakeholders 	<p>“Independent observer is a necessity to ensure neutrality of this process [project]. This person [independent observer] is present in all evaluation meetings and reports outwards.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>“The owner had hired an impartial observer to ensure that the procurement negotiations were fair and non-discriminatory. The impartial observer found no issues with the tendering process. A procurement consultant, financial expert, cost expert, neutral observer, management expert and alliance facilitator took part as experts commissioned by the owners.” (Value-for-money report, project Road Tunnel)</p>
	Engagement indicators	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Objectives related to external stakeholders 	<p>“...the pressure created by the positive publicity indicator—on which we base bonuses and sanctions—influences day-to-day operations. This delivery model and [publicity indicator] are good because the contractor is very sensitive to what they [publicists] write in the newspapers and journals, and so this influences our operations.” (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“Key result area: Public Image – The public image of the project is improved and the project gains demonstrable, general public approval. The public image of the project must be positive. The public image of the project improves and the acceptance of the project can be clearly ascertained.” (Project plan, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“...increase the attractiveness of railroad traffic to passengers by improving the service quality of passenger stations and platforms in terms of mobility and safety. Increase safety by removing railroad crossings with crossing at different levels. Expanding and improving parking and environment for passenger vehicles and bicycles.” (Value-for-money report, project Railroad)</p> <p>“We have been successful with the press and informing. At least we have now received an award for informing [external stakeholders] successfully.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>“We have placed particular emphasis on public image; whenever we do something, however small, we inform people about it well in advance in an attempt to minimize any negative image.” (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“One of the key results areas is public image. The objective is to achieve at least 85% neutral or positive publicity regarding the project, and currently we stand at 82%.” (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“The objectives of project communications and dialogue are: To offer key stakeholders (inhabitants, decision makers, authorities, housing associations etc.) sufficient and timely information about project, its progress and effects. Improve the public image of the project so that [project Road Tunnel] is a good example of an Alliance contract. Support the progress of the project through communications. Be prepared for communications regarding disturbances. Gather and disseminate information regarding the environmental changes (effects on people and landscape) and involve people.” (Project plan, project Road Tunnel)</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Value-for-money objectives emphasize external stakeholders' values 	<p>“The goal of implementing alliance model is to create more value with the society’s investments compared to regular project procurement models. Value for money means the balance of benefits (quality, technical requirements, societal and environmental requirements) compared to price and risks to achieve such benefits.” (Value-for-money report, project Railroad)</p> <p>“The value for money -approach focuses not just on the lowest possible cost and a fast or predictable turnaround but also on other factors that generate value to the owner and users. These include,</p>

			<p>among others, taking users', the owner's and other stakeholders' views and requirements into account, striving for high standards, promoting innovation and giving attention to social and environmental considerations. The alliance model makes use of cooperation between the parties, promotes innovation and reduces needless waste and unnecessary work. The alliance model seeks to realise the project in a manner that, compared to more traditional forms of procurement, will deliver more benefits and value to society and the money it has invested in the project." (Value-for-money report, project Road Tunnel)</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Industry-level objectives related to more transparent and trustful modus operandi in construction sector 	<p>"Construction productivity impact target: Lessons learnt from alliance contracting and the visibility of the projects have made several building contractors and the entire construction industry keener to promote the alliance contracting model and also to develop other contracting models." (Value-for-money report, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>"National Transport Agency chose to pilot alliance model, because it wanted achieve the following strategic objectives in procurement: ...Transform the operations culture of construction sector towards a more transparent and trustful modus operandi." (Value-for-money report, project Railroad)</p> <p>"In my opinion, the [National Transport Agency] has succeeded in promoting the development of the field by utilising previous experience and by sharing this information". (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p>
Value-based solutions	Engagement and collaboration values	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Community spirit encouraging cooperation, transparency and trust with external stakeholders 	<p>"It was evident that this different commercial [alliance] model required a different mindset for stakeholder collaboration." (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>"What does alliance spirit mean to me? It is, indeed, a brilliant way of working. To collaborate with stakeholders for the best of the project." (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>"Cooperation and trust: The [project Road Tunnel] alliance managed to create a positive team spirit between all the key parties involved in the project. The [project Road Tunnel] alliance engaged in extensive preliminary planning and dialogue with various authorities [external stakeholders]." (Value-for-money report, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>"...the collaboration that is formed [between internal and external stakeholders] is important because it enables the development of ideas that can be incorporated into the project." (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A committed attitude to implement new alliance delivery model together with external stakeholders 	<p>"But it [alliance model] requires that everyone is committed to it and working together with everyone." (Engineer, project Railroad)</p> <p>"Yes, they [stakeholders] are active and solve problems. There is no need to be against each other like in normal projects... we really try to find the best possible solution together." (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>"Collaboration, meaning that we do things together. Whether it is about communication, managing risks or creation of possibilities, it is collaboration. And the spirit that we make decisions together. This collaboration gives birth to everything in every area of this project. Also, transparency is of course one thing, meaning that we have no secrets, but all information is available, even though we are still learning this transparency." (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Best-for-project principle: working together toward a common goal, also shared by external stakeholders 	<p>"... these [best-for-project principle] vibes encourage us to think positively about all kinds of issues in trying to achieve the best end result for everyone." (Consultant, project Railroad)</p> <p>"...[the best-for-project principle] brings many advantages, especially for stakeholders who attend all kinds of meetings. The flow of information and communication [with external stakeholders] is somehow easier, and we have invested a lot in this." (Engineer, project Road Tunnel)</p>

	Practices for internalizing engagement and collaboration values	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Workshops, orientation, and training sessions to assimilate engagement and collaboration values 	<p>“We take [two psychologists] with us for two days, and we all go to a cabin in the woods for project training to raise everyone’s spirits, which has been spectacular.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>“These psychologists are experienced in facilitating and evaluating team working [and collaboration].” (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>“Organised workshops and other such processes to create the right Alliance culture and ethos, striving for maximum performance.” (Project plan, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“We have a lot of workshops, in very informal way that support understanding the collaboration.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Co-locational working space: free-form and informal small group working to internalize engagement and collaboration values 		<p>“[The Big Room] serves us well; because we have representatives from the [Tunnel City], [National Transport Agency] and designers, one can easily go to a designer, for instance, to ask about certain issues, which means that one is not dependent on emails and phone calls or [affected by] delays. We can just go and ask one another, which really supports everyone and the collaboration [among stakeholders].” (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“I have utilized it [co-locational working space] as much as possible. Like I said, it [co-locational working space] enables collaboration among all [stakeholders].” (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>“...problem solving is easier; because we are tightly integrated, and information travels fast, we can achieve solutions quickly. There is no problem with collaboration and activities [with external stakeholders] because all [internal stakeholders] have internalized this [mindset and values], so the collaboration works well.” (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“Collaborating there [in the co-locational working space] enabled us to get to know each other and helped us to understand these values.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Managers implement engagement and collaboration values by leading by own example 		<p>“I don’t think we have imprinted it [community spirit] systematically through tools but through leading by example.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>“Here, it is really about leading by example—it’s just the modern way. It shows that we, the management team, are also committed to this [community spirit], and that we appreciate these values [collaboration values].” (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Creating own project logo and identity: working for project and its common goal, also shared by external stakeholders 		<p>“We have these all kinds of stickers that people attach to their laptops, which then shows who work in this project. We also have these bags that we distributed with our own project logo and identity.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>“First comes in to my mind is that we had to show outward that we have a shared symbol, shared identity and values. ... and the idea came up pretty quickly that we want to achieve some signs of community spirit among everyone that can be seen everywhere.” (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“Of course, they [symbols and signs] have a positive influence in creating community spirit.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Preparing and doing research about how to work in alliance projects and adopt its engagement and collaboration values 		<p>“It is true that some of them [alliance partners] had clearly prepared themselves regarding how to work in group and organize accordingly [according to alliance and value-for-money principles].” (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“When we heard that project Railroad will be an alliance project, we were very excited to participate. My superior at that time flew to America to study alliances and their principles for few weeks and then came back to teach the rest of us. This was half a year before the tendering began. We had alliance books written in English, which we divided among ourselves and everyone read different parts, prepared summaries, and then taught others their section. Working in alliance did not really require any new knowledge per se, but it required a new way of thinking about. It is important to understand the central idea, the entire model and its values.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p>	

Dynamism-based solutions	Flexibility in day-to-day operations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Flexible roles and responsibilities for external stakeholder engagement 	<p>“In general, if a [person] has an epiphany regarding an issue that is not part of that person’s [original responsibilities]; this person can [still] suggest ideas about it. Then we would consider how to react to this idea and who might have the expertise to do it.” (Designer, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“We address all phone calls from [external stakeholders]. We divide tasks and roles flexibly to deal with [their] issues, and it has worked well.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>“At first it was a bit challenging to find my own role. No one really knew his or her role, because the role definition came from the alliance organization and it was very flexible. You learned your role by working and doing and trying.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>“I would argue that the biggest benefit for society as a whole is that we [internal stakeholders] can do things extremely well, but much more flexibly, with a smaller number of people.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Adaptive meeting, communication, and reporting protocols toward external stakeholders 	<p>“Communication has been adaptive through this organization and through the working groups. Dedicated persons have been responsible that the right information goes to right people the right way, and there has not been any problems.” (Consultant, project Railroad)</p> <p>“I think the greatest benefit has been the swiftness and easiness. I mean, you can summon a meeting anytime with any stakeholders to look into any kinds of issues.” (Engineer, project Road Tunnel)</p>
	Timely focus on the relevant activities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Focus on working rather than arguing with external stakeholders 	<p>“[Internal stakeholders] and [the National Transport Safety Agency] were able to define solutions together and follow through an exceptional permit process in a measured way. When designing railroad work patterns, optimal shifts were scheduled [together] with [the Track Operator], which aided construction and minimized disruption of railroad traffic.” (Value-for-money report, project Railroad)</p> <p>“Today, we had this issue [regarding external stakeholders] that cost 10 000. But we do not focus on whose fault it is, but we focus on solving the issue. We do not focus on fighting with them [external stakeholders]. This is an unconditional example of the transparency.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>“One good thing is that whenever [any kind of] change occurs, there is no need to fight about it; instead, we focus on solving and doing.” (Coordinator, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“Everyone has seen through this that we have quickly left out all unnecessary squabble which is not part of this transparency.” (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“We have good links with authorities and [other external stakeholders]. Whenever any issues arise, everyone tries to help to resolve them as best they can, and I think it is a positive thing.” (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“This model [alliance model] means that we hardly fight about issues, but we need to make decisions together. Everyone knows that we do not want to go to the court with any stakeholder, meaning that we need to settle all issues, which drives us to this collaboration and joint decision-making.” (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Swift and efficient problem-solving together with external stakeholders 	<p>“The time of hearing was delayed for some reasons and there were many complaints [from external stakeholders] and other things. However, we were able to consider swiftly their concerns in the implementation. Flexibility is good in this model.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>“Dealing with change efficiently is part of the alliance methodology, where the focus is on solving problems together instead of solving who caused the problem.” (Value-for-money report, project Railroad)</p> <p>“I think that the biggest offering of this alliance model is that we can concretely see that when something unexpected occurs, we can deal with it and solve it very quickly. Dealing with exceptions has been very fast and we have solved problems with incredible speed.” (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p>

			<p>“Working has been nice in the sense that if we consider all the challenges that we had [with external stakeholders], we have focused our efforts in dealing with the issues as efficiently as possible. If we had a different procurement model, we would be arguing all the time. We have used our energy to deal with issues.” (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“Collaboration is what has been working well, because there has been no boundaries with stakeholders. We can noticeably faster deal with issues.” (Designer, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“Problem solving is so much easier when we are all integrated tightly and information flows quickly, so we can solve problems together very quickly.” (Manager, project Road Tunnel)</p>
	<p>Communication systems</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Systems for collecting feedback from external stakeholders 	<p>“We have this feedback system [for external stakeholders] on our website, which we update constantly. We note all references from [external stakeholders]—thousands of references, all recorded—and we take action. And when an issue has been resolved, we document everything.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>“The site engineer will collect [end-user] feedback in a separate folder, and all comments received from the [end-users] will be forwarded to the client’s feedback system.” (Project plan, project Road Tunnel)</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gathering learning regarding experiences with external stakeholders 	<p>“At the end of January we will organize this workshop where we have this kind of lessons learned sparring session facilitated by [psychologist].” (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>“We have this exceptional reporting protocol, which is one of the best tools from learning perspective. We report all exceptions [with stakeholders] systematically and learn from them.” (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>“Value for money reporting gives alliances an opportunity to demonstrate: What the alliance learned from the project.” (Value-for-money report, project Road Tunnel)</p>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Centralized electronic project document bank to share information regarding external stakeholders 	<p>“...it is easier to acquire information from this [project] organization for communicating with [external stakeholders].” (Manager, Project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“All the information has been centralized in cloud services, and personnel can access information from everywhere and they know how to do it. Our publicists knows how to use this outwards for informing [external stakeholders].” (Manager, project Railroad)</p> <p>“An electronic project bank is used in document management and distribution. All materials from the project are saved in the project bank in an electronic format which also functions as a hand-over material bank as the project is implemented – no paper based materials are used.” (Project plan, project Road Tunnel)</p> <p>“We have this project document bank, where we store everything. Its use has improved constantly.” (Coordinator, project Road Tunnel)</p>